

PSYCH-APPEAL, INC.
Meiram Bendat (Cal. Bar No. 198884)
8560 West Sunset Boulevard, Suite 500
West Hollywood, CA 90069
Tel: (310) 598-3690, x.101
Fax: (888) 975-1957
mbendat@psych-appeal.com

ZUCKERMAN SPAEDER LLP
D. Brian Hufford (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Jason S. Cowart (admitted *pro hac vice*)
399 Park Avenue, 14th Floor
New York, NY 10022
Tel: (212) 704-9600
Fax: (212) 704-4256
dbhufford@zuckerman.com
jcowart@zuckerman.com

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

DAVID AND NATASHA WIT, *et al.*,
Plaintiffs,

v.

UNITED BEHAVIORAL HEALTH
(operating as OPTUMHEALTH
BEHAVIORAL SOLUTIONS),
Defendant.

Case No. 3:14-CV-02346-JCS
Action Filed: May 21, 2014

**DECLARATION OF CAROLINE E.
REYNOLDS IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS'
MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION**

GARY ALEXANDER, *et al.*,
Plaintiffs,

v.

UNITED BEHAVIORAL HEALTH
(operating as OPTUMHEALTH
BEHAVIORAL SOLUTIONS),
Defendant.

Case No. 3:14-CV-05337-JCS
Action Filed: December 4, 2014

Date: June 17, 2016
Time: 9:30 A.M.
Judge: Hon. Joseph C. Spero
Courtroom: G

**REDACTED VERSION OF SEALED
DOCUMENT**

1 I, CAROLINE REYNOLDS, declare and state as follows:

2 1. I am over 18 years of age. I am an attorney licensed to practice in New York
3 State and the District of Columbia and have been admitted *pro hac vice* to practice before this
4 Court in this case. I am a partner of the law firm Zuckerman Spaeder LLP, and counsel of record
5 in the above-captioned actions for Plaintiffs David and Natasha Wit, Lori Flanzraich, Cecilia
6 Holdnak, Brian Muir, Brandt Pfeifer, Linda Tillitt, Gary Alexander, Michael Driscoll, David
7 Haffner, and Corinna Klein (collectively “Plaintiffs”). I am responsible for the day-to-day
8 management of this action. I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth herein.

9 2. **Exhibit A-1** hereto is a true and correct copy of a chart I prepared, entitled,
10 “Summary of Selected Level of Care Guideline Provisions Over-Emphasizing Acute Criteria.”
11 The chart indicates whether the UBH Level of Care Guidelines for each year from 2011-2016,
12 relevant excerpts from which are attached hereto as Exhibit B, contain the provisions described
13 in the first column of the chart.

14 3. **Exhibit A-2** hereto is a true and correct copy of a chart I prepared, entitled,
15 “Coverage Determination Guideline Analysis.” The chart lists the UBH Coverage
16 Determination Guidelines (“CDGs”) that Plaintiffs are challenging in this litigation, excerpts of
17 which are attached hereto as Exhibit C. The CDGs are listed by year, diagnosis and (where
18 applicable) level of care. The chart indicates whether the CDG incorporates the criteria
19 contained in UBH’s Level of Care Guidelines for the corresponding year. A “yes” answer in that
20 column indicates that the CDG: (1) includes, verbatim, the criteria found in the Level of Care
21 Guidelines’ Common Criteria; (2) incorporates the Level of Care Guidelines by reference by
22 citing to the applicable “LOCG”; and/or (3) states that coverage is excluded if services are not
23 consistent with UBH’s Level of Care Guidelines.

24 4. **Exhibit B** hereto is a true and correct copy of a compilation of excerpts from
25 UBH’s Level of Care Guidelines for the years 2011-2016. The Guidelines appear in reverse
26 chronological order, beginning with 2016 and ending with 2011. Each year’s excerpt contains
27 the Introduction; Common Criteria (including criteria relevant to admission, continued services,

and discharge); and the level-of-care criteria applicable to Mental Health Residential Treatment; Mental Health Intensive Outpatient Program; Mental Health Outpatient Treatment, Substance Use Disorder Residential Rehabilitation; Substance Use Disorder Intensive Outpatient Program; and Substance Use Disorder Outpatient Treatment. For ease of reference, the Guidelines in Exhibit B have been numbered sequentially, in the bottom right corner, from page B0001 through B0211, as follows:

Guideline	Exhibit Page Nos.
2016 Level of Care Guidelines	B0001 - B0042
2015 Level of Care Guidelines	B0043 - B0082
2014 Level of Care Guidelines	B0083 - B0119
2013 Level of Care Guidelines	B0120 - B0153
2012 Level of Care Guidelines	B0154 - B0183
2011 Level of Care Guidelines	B0184 - B0211

5. **Exhibit C** hereto is a true and correct copy of a compilation of relevant excerpts from the UBH Coverage Determination Guidelines listed on the chart in Exhibit A-2. For ease of reference, the Guidelines in Exhibit C have been numbered sequentially, in the bottom left corner, from page C0001 through C1378.

6. **Exhibit D** hereto is a true and correct copy of two documents produced in this litigation by UBH, in native-file format, with the bates numbers UBHWIT0000271 and UBHWIT0000272.

7. **Exhibit E** hereto is a true and correct copy of relevant excerpts from documents produced by UBH with the bates numbers UBHWIT0070985, UBHWIT0071027, UBHWIT0070865, UBHWIT0071112, and UBHWIT0136584. For ease of reference, the documents in Exhibit E have been numbered sequentially, in the bottom right corner, from page E0001 through E0069. This Exhibit has been filed **UNDER SEAL**.

1 8. **Exhibit F** hereto is a true and correct copy of a chart I prepared, entitled, “Named
2 Plaintiffs and Sample Claimants in the Putative Classes.” The chart indicates the Class, if any,
3 as to which each Named Plaintiff and Sample Claimant satisfies the Class definition, and cites,
4 by Exhibit page number, to the documents included in Exhibits G – J that support that
5 conclusion. This Exhibit has been filed **UNDER SEAL**.

6 9. **Exhibit G** hereto is a true and correct copy of a compilation of letters from UBH
7 to each Named Plaintiff providing written notification that their requests for coverage were
8 denied, along with an excerpt from UBH’s electronic case record for each Named Plaintiff
9 containing the pages relevant to each such denial. For ease of reference, the documents in
10 Exhibit G have been numbered sequentially, in the bottom right corner, from page G0001
11 through G0069. This Exhibit has been filed **UNDER SEAL**.

12 10. **Exhibit H** hereto is a true and correct copy of a compilation of documents pro-
13 duced by UBH with respect to each Sample Claimant who requested coverage for residential
14 treatment. The Exhibit includes, for each such Sample Claimant, (a) relevant excerpts from
15 UBH’s electronic case record containing the pages relevant to each such denial; or (b) the letter
16 from UBH to each such Sample Claimant providing written notification of the denial. UBH
17 produced each such document with a “Unique ID” corresponding to the relevant Sample
18 Claimant stamped in the top left corner. For ease of reference, the documents in Exhibit H have
19 been numbered sequentially, in the bottom right corner, from page H0001 through H0237. This
20 Exhibit has been filed **UNDER SEAL**.

21 11. **Exhibit I** hereto is a true and correct copy of a compilation of documents pro-
22 duced by UBH with respect to each Sample Claimant who requested coverage for outpatient
23 treatment. The Exhibit includes, for each such Sample Claimant, (a) relevant excerpts from
24 UBH’s electronic case record containing the pages relevant to each such denial; or (b) the letter
25 from UBH to each such Sample Claimant providing written notification of the denial. UBH
26 produced each such document with a “Unique ID” corresponding to the relevant Sample
27 Claimant stamped in the top left corner. For ease of reference, the documents in Exhibit I have
28

1 been numbered sequentially, in the bottom right corner, from page I0001 through I0136. This
2 Exhibit has been filed **UNDER SEAL**.

3 12. **Exhibit J** hereto is a true and correct copy of a compilation of documents pro-
4 duced by UBH with respect to each Sample Claimant who requested coverage for intensive
5 outpatient treatment. The Exhibit includes, for each such Sample Claimant, (a) relevant excerpts
6 from UBH's electronic case record containing the pages relevant to each such denial; or (b) the
7 letter from UBH to each such Sample Claimant providing written notification of the denial.
8 UBH produced each such document with a "Unique ID" corresponding to the relevant Sample
9 Claimant stamped in the top left corner. For ease of reference, the documents in Exhibit J have
10 been numbered sequentially, in the bottom right corner, from page J0001 through J0136. This
11 Exhibit has been filed **UNDER SEAL**.

12 13. **Exhibit K** hereto is a true and correct copy of a chart I prepared, entitled, "Plan
13 Term Analysis." This exhibit indicates whether the terms of the Named Plaintiffs' plans and
14 each of the plans in the agreed-upon Plan Sample conditions coverage for mental health and
15 substance use disorder treatment upon a finding that the services are consistent with generally
16 accepted standards of care. The chart answers "yes" to this question if the plan terms (a) define
17 Covered Services as services that are consistent with generally accepted standards of care or as
18 services that are Medically Necessary; (b) exclude coverage for services that are *not* consistent
19 with generally accepted standards of care or services that are *not* Medically Necessary; and/or
20 (c) define Medically Necessary services as those that are consistent with generally accepted
21 standards of care. The chart cites the relevant excerpts for each plan, attached hereto in Exhibits
22 L-O, by Exhibit page number. This Exhibit has been filed **UNDER SEAL**.

23 14. **Exhibit L** hereto is a true and correct copy of a compilation of relevant excerpts
24 from the plan term documents for each Named Plaintiff. For ease of reference, the documents in
25 Exhibit L have been numbered sequentially, in the bottom right corner, from page L0001 through
26 L0180. Portions of this Exhibit have been filed **UNDER SEAL**.

1 15. **Exhibit M** hereto is a true and correct copy of a compilation of relevant excerpts
2 from the plan term documents produced by UBH with respect to each Sample Claimant who
3 requested coverage for residential treatment. UBH produced each such document with a “Unique
4 ID” corresponding to the relevant Sample Claimant stamped in the top left corner. For ease of
5 reference, the documents in Exhibit M have been numbered sequentially, in the bottom right
6 corner, from page M0001 through M0721. This Exhibit has been filed **UNDER SEAL**.

7 16. **Exhibit N** hereto is a true and correct copy of a compilation of relevant excerpts
8 from the plan term documents produced by UBH with respect to each Sample Claimant who
9 requested coverage for outpatient treatment. UBH produced each such document with a “Unique
10 ID” corresponding to the relevant Sample Claimant stamped in the top left corner. For ease of
11 reference, the documents in Exhibit N have been numbered sequentially, in the bottom right
12 corner, from page N0001 through N0352. This Exhibit has been filed **UNDER SEAL**.

13 17. **Exhibit O** hereto is a true and correct copy of a compilation of relevant excerpts
14 from the plan term documents produced by UBH with respect to each Sample Claimant who
15 requested coverage for intensive outpatient treatment. UBH produced each such document with
16 a “Unique ID” corresponding to the relevant Sample Claimant stamped in the top left corner.
17 For ease of reference, the documents in Exhibit O have been numbered sequentially, in the
18 bottom right corner, from page O0001 through O0409. This Exhibit has been filed **UNDER**
19 **SEAL**.

20 18. **Exhibit P** hereto is a true and correct copy of a compilation of excerpts from the
21 transcripts of the following depositions taken in this matter:

22

Exhibit Page	Date	Deponent
P0001 – P0005	March 18, 2016	UBH 30(b)(6) designee, John Beaty

23
24
25
26
27
28

Exhibit Page	Date	Deponent
P0006 – P0014	January 20, 2016	UBH 30(b)(6) designee, Margaret Brennecke
P0015 – P0023	February 5, 2016	UBH 30(b)(6) designee, Frances Bridge
P0024 – P0043	January 28, 2016	UBH 30(b)(6) designee, Lorenzo Triana
P0044 – P0046	February 11, 2016	UBH Medical Director, Satwant Ahluwalia
P0047 – P0052	January 18, 2016	UBH Medical Director, Theodore Allchin
P0053 – P0057	February 3, 2016	UBH Medical Director, Leslie Moldauer
P0058 – P0064	February 9, 2016	UBH Psychologist Peer Reviewer, Lin Zhu
P0065 – P0067	October 15, 2015	Named Plaintiff Lori Flanzraich
P0068 – P0069	September 22, 2015	Named Plaintiff Cecilia Holdnak
P0070 – P0071	September 4, 2015	Named Plaintiff Brian Muir
P0072 – P0074	October 30, 2015	Named Plaintiff David Haffner

For ease of reference, the documents in Exhibit P have been numbered sequentially, in the bottom right corner, from page P0001 through P0074. This Exhibit has been filed **UNDER SEAL**.

1 19. **Exhibit Q** hereto is a true and correct copy of the parties' Joint Stipulation
2 Concerning Sampling Methodology ("Joint Stipulation") along with the attachments thereto.
3 Five of the Joint Stipulation's attachments are excel spreadsheets containing a large amount of
4 data, and are being submitted to the Court in electronic format only because their size makes
5 printing impossible, as stated in the "Notice of Manual Filing" submitted concurrently herewith.
6 This Exhibit has been filed **UNDER SEAL**.

7 [REDACTED]
8 [REDACTED]
9 [REDACTED]
10 [REDACTED]
11 [REDACTED]
12 [REDACTED]
13 [REDACTED]
14 [REDACTED]
15 [REDACTED]
16 [REDACTED]
17 [REDACTED]
18 [REDACTED]
19 [REDACTED]
20 [REDACTED]
21 [REDACTED]
22 [REDACTED]
23 [REDACTED]
24 [REDACTED]

25 [REDACTED]
26 [REDACTED]
27 [REDACTED]
28 [REDACTED]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

20. **Exhibit R** hereto is a true and correct copy of the *Wit* Plaintiffs' Consolidated Supplemental Responses and Objections to Defendant's Second Set of Interrogatories, which Plaintiffs served on UBH on January 18, 2016.

21. **Exhibit S** hereto is a true and correct copy of letters UBH sent to the Named Plaintiffs providing written notification that their internal administrative appeals were denied, which were produced by UBH in this litigation. Exhibit S also includes an appeal letter

1 submitted to UBH on behalf of Corinna Klein, which was produced by her doctor, third party Dr.
2 Mark Leffert. For ease of reference, the documents in Exhibit S have been numbered
3 sequentially, in the bottom right corner, from page S0001 through S0032. Exhibit S is being filed
4 **UNDER SEAL.**

5 22. **Exhibit T** hereto is a true and correct copy hereto is a true and correct copy of
6 relevant excerpts from documents produced by UBH, in native-file format, with the bates
7 numbers UBHWIT00263505, UBHWIT0263506, and UBHWIT0263517. For ease of reference,
8 the documents in Exhibit T have been numbered sequentially, in the bottom right corner, from
9 page T0001 through T0038. This Exhibit has been filed **UNDER SEAL.**

10 23. **Exhibit U** hereto is a true and correct copy of the biographies of Zuckerman
11 Spaeder attorneys D. Brian Hufford, Jason S. Cowart, Caroline E. Reynolds, Andrew Caridas,
12 and Ramya Kasturi, and the resume of Psych-Appeal, Inc. founder, Dr. Meiram Bendat, J.D.,
13 PhD.

14
15 I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

16
17 Executed this 28th day of March, 2016, at Washington, DC.

18
19 s/ Caroline E. Reynolds
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28